

R06

F/TH/23/0492

PROPOSAL: Erection of pitched roof front extensions with alterations to fenestration to provide first floor storage

LOCATION: 22 Grosvenor Road BROADSTAIRS Kent CT10 2BT

WARD: Viking

AGENT: Mr Tony Michael

APPLICANT: Mr Mike Beaumont

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse Permission

Refuse for the following reasons:

1 The proposed development, by virtue of its design, height and overall scale, would appear unduly dominant and discordant, and an isolated feature within the streetscene that appears out of keeping with the adjacent low-rise garage buildings to the south, whilst detracting from and obscuring views of the adjacent historic flint church. The contribution the enlarged storage building would make to the economic needs of the area does not outweigh the severe visual harm to the street scene and surrounding character and appearance of the area (as a result of the materially diminished proposal), contrary to the requirements of Thanet Local Plan Policies SP04 and QD02, Policy BSP9 of the Broadstairs and St Peter's Neighbourhood Plan and paragraphs 130 and 135 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

SITE, LOCATION AND DESCRIPTION

The building is a modest single storey stand alone brick built structure set back from the highway to the rear of No 5 Osborne Road. To the north boundary of the site is Christ Church and to the south are a number of flat roofed structures and areas of hardstanding. The eastern side of Grosvenor Road is predominantly residential in character, comprising two storey pitched roof dwellings, with further residential properties to the north of the church. The front elevation of the building includes a window with black stained timber cladding detail and a pair of full height, side hung doors and the building has a shallow mono pitched roof. The hardstanding area to the front of the site provides off-street parking for two vehicles.

PLANNING HISTORY

F/TH/16/1749 - Change of use from office to a two storey dwelling, including a two storey front and rear extension and alterations to roof, and replacement of fence panel to rear with a 2.4 metre high brick wall. Refused 15.02.2017 Appeal - Dismissed 06.07.2017

F/TH/17/1369 - Change of use from office to studio flat with alteration of roof to allow a mezzanine bedroom. Refused 13 November 2017

F/TH/20/0595 - Erection of first floor extension together with two storey rear extension
Refused 11.09.2020

Reason for refusal: *The proposed development, by virtue of its design and overall scale, would be out of keeping with the nearby low-rise and low-key built form and the adjacent church, and being located outside of the designated Primary and Secondary Frontages of Broadstairs, the contribution the enlarged building would make to the economic needs of the area, are not outweighed by its incongruous appearance within the street scene, resulting in severe visual harm which fails to respect the surrounding pattern of development, contrary to aims of Local Plan Policies E04, E05, QD02 and SP04 and paragraphs 127, 130 and 131 of the NPPF*

F/TH/22/0825 - Erection of single storey front extension together with alterations to roof and fenestration Granted 20 September 2022

F/TH/22/1300 - Erection of single storey front extension together with alterations to roof and fenestration Refused 22 November 2022

Reason for Refusal: *The proposed development, by virtue of its design, height and overall scale, would appear unduly dominant and discordant, and an isolated feature within the streetscene that appears out of keeping with the adjacent low-rise garage buildings to the south, whilst detracting from and obscuring views of the adjacent historic flint church. The contribution the enlarged storage building would make to the economic needs of the area does not outweigh the severe visual harm to the street scene and surrounding character and appearance of the area (as a result of the materially diminished proposal), contrary to the requirements of Thanet Local Plan Policies SP04 and QD02, Policy BSP9 of the Broadstairs and St Peter's Neighbourhood Plan and paragraphs 130 and 135 of the National Planning Policy Framework.*

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The application seeks planning permission to extend the building with the erection of a single storey pitched roof extension to the front elevation, and the addition of a first floor to the main building within a new pitched roof to provide additional storage space. Within the gable end to the front elevation it is proposed to install a window at first floor level and at ground floor level it is proposed to install a pedestrian entrance door. Internally a staircase would be installed to access the first floor storage space.

The gable is proposed to be clad with black stained timber cladding, with a slate pitched roof.

PLANNING POLICIES

Thanet Local Plan 2020

SP35 - Quality Developments

E05 - Sequential and Impact Test

QD02 - General Design Principles

QD03 - Living Conditions

SP04 - Economic Growth

TP03 - Cycling

TP06 - Car Parking

Broadstairs & St Peter's Neighbourhood Development Plan 2018-2031

BSP9: Design in Broadstairs & St Peter's

NOTIFICATIONS

Neighbours have been notified and a site notice posted and the following comments have been received:

The Broadstairs Society - This property has had a long history but it has reached the stage where the Society has no adverse comment to make on this application.

Broadstairs & St Peter's Town Council - The Committee recommends ACCEPTING this application. The Committee does not think a pitched roof is out of keeping within this area. (Unanimous)

COMMENTS

This application is reported to the Planning Committee at the request of Cllr Mike Garner to enable Members to consider the impact of the proposed first floor pitched roof element on the surrounding area.

The main considerations in assessing the proposal are the impact on the character and appearance of the area, impact on the living conditions of neighbouring residential occupiers and highway safety.

Principle of Development

The site is located within the urban confines and the proposal relates to the extension of an existing building used as a store for an existing business.

Thanet Local Plan Policy SP04 relates to economic growth and aims to accommodate inward investment in job creating development, the establishment of new businesses and expansion and diversification of existing firms. The building is used for the applicant's microbrewery business for the storage of kegs of beer and this application seeks to increase the storage capacity of the building.

The Local Plan identifies land and premises considered suitable for continued and future employment uses. Within the urban area (as defined on the Policies Map) proposals for employment generating development on non-allocated sites will be supported in principle, subject to meeting the requirements of other policies in the Plan.

The policy states that Thanet's town centres are priority areas for regeneration and employment. This policy is supported by paragraph 81 of the NPPF which states that 'decisions should help create the conditions in which businesses can invest, expand and adapt'. The building is not located within the town centre of Broadstairs, however it is an established storage building connected to commercial business located close to commercial outlets at The Broadway and within the High Street and therefore, subject to there being no conflict with other policies in the Plan, proposals that support the expansion of the business is supported by this policy.

Planning permission has recently been granted to extend the internal floor space of the building to accommodate increased storage needs (F/TH/22/0825). Whilst the building is outside the town centre its close proximity to commercial outlets together with the modest depth of extensions to the front of the building was considered acceptable. The approved development maintained the single storey character in keeping with the low-rise and low-key built form on this side of Grosvenor Road. Furthermore the extended building allowed views through to the Church which the Planning Inspector considered made a positive contribution to the street scene.

As with the previously refused application the applicant again requires further storage capacity and proposes this through the addition of a mezzanine floor, in addition to the front extensions previously approved with a flat roof. The additional floor space requires a staircase for access which reduces the amount of usable space both on the ground floor and at first floor, and the loft floor plan indicates the edges by the eaves would not provide usable storage space. Beer kegs are available in many sizes and the photographs provided within the Statement show a variety of keg sizes being stored on the ground and stacked in various groups. There is no further information provided as to the existing storage capacity within the building and future storage needs, or whether alternative storage solutions have been investigated such as racking or extending to the rear. It would appear that beer kegs, whether empty or full, have significant weight and carrying and stacking kegs to any height may potentially result in safety issues, whilst carrying heavy kegs to the upper floor does not appear to be a very practical solution for the storage. Nevertheless the supporting Planning Statement indicates this is intended, stating that the staircase and additional floor is required to allow some stacking of kegs.

The additional storage space proposed significantly increases the height and scale of the building within the street. Policy SP04 supports the expansion of existing businesses providing that the development meets the requirements of other policies in the Plan.

The principle of an extended storage use on the site is therefore considered acceptable, but this is subject to the assessment of material considerations in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and Local Plan Policies. The previous Planning Inspector's decision is also a material consideration in the determination of this application given the similarities between the schemes.

Character and Appearance

The building is a modest single storey stand alone brick built structure, situated in a predominantly residential area. The building is set back from the road with a parking area to

the front and has a shallow mono-pitched roof. The front elevation includes a window with black stained timber cladding detail and a pair of full height, side hung doors. The building is currently internally divided into two rooms, providing a store and a small office space. The building has extant planning permission to extend the building 4 metres and 1.2 metres to the front to provide additional storage space (F/TH/22/0825).

It is now proposed to extend the building further to provide additional storage capacity for the business. The footprint of the building would be extended to the front as previously approved. However the 2.65 metre high previously approved flat roof would be replaced by a pitched roof resulting in the 4 metre front projecting being finished with a pitched roof with a ridge height of approximately 3.85 metres. The roof above the main part of the building, with the 1.2 metre extension, would be finished with a pitched roof with a finished ridge height of approximately 5.7 metres.

From the front elevation the front projection would have a gable end with double doors below and the gable end within the main part of the building would be finished with a 1.2 metre square window at first floor level. A pedestrian entrance door would be installed within the ground floor extension. Internally it is proposed to install a staircase to access the first floor storage space. The Planning Statement submitted with the application explains that the applicant requires more storage space for kegs of beer due to increased demand in the applicant's microbrewery business. The pitched roof, together with the staircase, would allow for roof space storage. The Statement explains that an 'A frame' roof would allow reasonable head room within the roof space to facilitate the storage requirements. Photographs have been included within the statement showing a number of kegs stacked and laying on the floor. The highest stack shown is 5 kegs high with others being 2 or 3 kegs high.

This application is a resubmission of the previously refused application, submitted under planning reference F/TH/22/1300, with the same drawings submitted. The pitched roof design with addition of window and door gives the building a residential appearance that would be out of keeping with the pattern of development in this location which is one of single storey buildings. In February 2017 planning permission was refused (F/TH/16/1749) for the change of use of the building to a two storey dwelling, the building works included a two storey front and rear extension and alterations to roof. The refusal notice was taken to Appeal and with regards to the character and appearance of the area the Planning Inspector commented that *'Despite being something of an anomaly in the street scene, the existing office building is visually unassuming in the street scene.'* *'The lack of dwellings fronting the road in this area, and the small-scale, unobtrusive and low-rise form of built development here, gives a relatively open character to this part of Grosvenor Road with notable separation between the front of the Grosvenor Road properties and the rear elevations of Osborne Road. While the quality of the existing office building or the garage and outbuildings is not particularly high, this arrangement gives a spacious feel to the road, which forms a key part of its existing character.'*

The Inspector described the building as being *'substantially larger than the existing office and nearby garages, which would result in a prominent presence in the relatively open street scene.'* *'Furthermore, as a result of its height, scale and siting, the house would partially obscure the church in views along the road, and would appear unduly dominant and*

discordant in relation to it. While the church is not listed, its features including flint elevations and stone mullion windows add significant interest to the local street scene.'

Whilst the current application does not propose a two storey residential dwelling the existing building would be significantly increased in height and extend further towards the public highway and therefore the Inspector's comments regarding the additional height and scale of the building, and its relationship with neighbouring buildings, is a relevant material consideration in the determination of this application.

Within the Planning Statement the applicant has provided an Area Plan annotating the roof forms of surrounding development. The plan shows pitched roof dwellings opposite the site, and to the north of the Church, and on dwellings to the rear fronting Gladstone Road. To the south of the site there are two buildings annotated with flat roofs. The Statement argues that the pitched roof design relates to the surrounding development as 'virtually all buildings have pitched roofs' and the only flat roof structures are on 'the 2 small garages to the rear of properties in The Broadway.' Whilst the Area Plan identifies pitched roof forms in the vicinity, these are residential dwellings whereas the storage building and garages are non residential buildings and have flat roofs. Furthermore, it is the accumulation of the pitched roof with the first floor bulk that is objected to, as it's being added to a building that is currently of a modest scale and design, that reflects the character of development on this side of the road.

In concluding the Appeal decision for the two storey dwelling the Inspector states '*... the location, design and overall scale of the house would be out of keeping with the nearby low-rise and low-key built form and the adjacent church, which would fail to respect the surrounding pattern of development and result in an incongruous appearance in the street scene. This would be inconsistent with saved Policy D1 of the Thanet Local Plan 2006 (LP), which sets out general design principles including that development should respect or enhance the character or appearance of the surrounding area particularly in scale, massing and rhythm, and use materials appropriate to the locality.'* The Inspector also noted that the use of '*cladding to the upper elevations would be likely to exacerbate the incongruous nature of the development in a locality where I saw that traditional materials predominate and such cladding does not form part of the general established character.'* Thanet Local Plan Policy has been replaced with Policy QD02, however the design requirements of the policy remain the same and the policy is supported by paragraph 130 of the NPPF which states that decisions should ensure that development will function well and add to the overall quality of the area, and are sympathetic to local character and history, including the surrounding built environment. Furthermore, paragraph 135 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) advises that '*Local planning authorities should seek to ensure that the quality of approved development is not materially diminished between permission and completion, as a result of changes being made to the permitted scheme.'* The revised proposal would increase the height and scale of the building and significantly diminish the quality of the previously approved modest form of development.

An application for a first floor addition has previously been refused three times. The initial refusal (F/TH/16/1749) was appealed and dismissed by the Inspector as set out above. The subsequent two refusals F/TH/20/0595 and F/TH/22/1300 were both refused for similar reasons, in that they included a first floor addition that was considered to be out of keeping

with the area. This application includes the same plans that were previously refused under F/TH/22/1300. The previous refusal reasons have therefore not been addressed in that the applicant is continuing with the same first floor addition that the Council and Inspector has previously advised is unacceptable. These previous refusals, and the Inspectors decision, are material considerations in the determination of this application.

The proposed development, with its pitched roof first floor addition, first floor front elevation window, and cladding detail would continue to give the storage building a residential appearance that appears overly dominant in the streetscene, and at odds with the prevailing single storey development, in the immediate vicinity. In addition the additional height and built form would impact upon and restrict views of the church and its features including flint elevations and stone mullion windows which, as noted by the Inspector, adds significant interest to the streetscene. There is also concern that should any permission be granted for a first floor addition to the building, that this could set a precedent for the other structures on this side of the road, which cumulatively could change the character of the area.

It is therefore considered that the proposed development would have a severely harmful impact upon the visual amenities of the locality, contrary to Policy QD02 of the Thanet Local Plan, and the NPPF.

Living Conditions

With regards to residential amenity the building would increase in height and be extended forwards towards the public highway.

The rear elevation would increase in height by approximately 2.5 metres, with the roof having a finished ridge height of nearly 6 metres. There are no additional door or window openings proposed within the rear elevation and therefore no resulting overlooking or loss of privacy. There is a separation distance of more than 7 metres to No 5 Gladstone Road to the rear and the development is therefore unlikely to result in significant loss of outlook and light to neighbouring windows. To the side boundaries there is a church building and hardstanding for vehicles and the front elevation faces the public highway where there is mutual overlooking from the street.

The increased storage capacity of the building may result in increased levels of activity within the site however the building has planning permission to operate as a commercial business and the increased storage space is unlikely to significantly impact on residential amenity through potential noise and disturbance.

Given the above the enlargement of the building would have minimal impact on nearby residential occupiers, and therefore the development would meet the requirements of Thanet Local Plan Policy QD03 and the NPPF.

Highways

This is an existing business located within easy walking distance of the High Street and bus and rail connections and is sustainably located. The extension results in the loss of one off-street parking space to the front and maintains a single 3 metre wide by 5 metre deep

parking space. This space would be capable of providing off-street parking for a small vehicle or van to collect or make deliveries. The Planning Statement highlights the need for the increased storage due to a sharp increase in demand for the applicant's micro brewery business and whilst the proposal would enlarge the storage space it is unlikely to significantly increase the amount of pedestrian and vehicular movements to and from the premises and therefore would be unlikely to lead to a material increase in demand for on street parking to the detriment of highway safety. The space to the front would provide storage space for bicycles in addition to the rear yard, which could be used by staff for the safe storage of bicycles.

Given the above it is considered the proposed development would meet the requirements of Thanet Local Plan policies TP03 and TP06 and the NPPF.

Other Matters

The applicant has submitted a petition in support of the development, however this has limited weight, and no comments have been submitted through the neighbour consultation period for this application.

Conclusion

The proposed development, with its pitched roof first floor addition, first floor front elevation window, and cladding detail would continue to give the storage building a residential appearance that appears overly dominant in the streetscene, and at odds with the prevailing single storey development, in the immediate vicinity. In addition the additional height and built form would impact upon and restrict views of the church and its features including flint elevations and stone mullion windows which, as noted by the Inspector, adds significant interest to the streetscene. There is also concern that should any permission be granted for a first floor addition to the building, that this could set a precedent for the other structures on this side of the road, which cumulatively could change the character of the area.

The application does not address the reasons for refusal set out within each of the three previously refused applications, nor the concerns raised by the Inspector within the appeal decision.

The contribution the enlarged building would make to the economic needs of the area are therefore not considered to outweigh the severe visual harm resulting from the scale and design of the proposed development in this location, contrary to Thanet Local Plan Policies SP04 and QD02, Policy BSP9 of the Broadstairs and St Peter's Neighbourhood Plan and paragraphs 130 and 135 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

It is therefore recommended that Members refuse the application.

Case Officer

Rosemary Bullivant

TITLE:

F/TH/23/0492

Project

22 Grosvenor Road BROADSTAIRS Kent CT10 2BT

